ABERDEEN, 31 August 2022. Minute of Meeting of the OPERATIONAL DELIVERY COMMITTEE. <u>Present</u>:- Councillor Radley, <u>Convener</u>; Councillor Yuill, <u>Vice-Convener</u>; and Councillors Ali, Brooks, David Cameron, the Lord Provost (as substitute for Councillor Hazel Cameron), Delaney, the Depute Provost, Grant (for articles 18 to 24 - as substitute for Councillor Graham) Hutchison, Macdonald (for articles 1 to 17 - as substitute for Councillor Graham), Massey, McLeod (as substitute for Councillor Houghton), McRae (as substitute for Councillor Allard), Nicoll and Thomson.

The agenda and reports associated with this minute can be found here.

Please note that if any changes are made to this minute at the point of approval, these will be outlined in the subsequent minute and this document will not be retrospectively altered.

ANNOUNCEMENT

1. The Convener began the meeting by firstly providing a verbal update on the recent fire at Altens East Recycling plant. The Convener advised that the fire had been a huge blow for Aberdeen City Council which had a significant impact on the Waste and Recycling Team. However, on a positive note, she advised that the emergency response had been nothing short of impressive.

The Convener explained that to move the refuse collection fleet with no notice and relocate it to Kittybrewster within a few hours, and then to re-establish the service within 24 hours was a remarkable achievement which everyone concerned should be very proud of. Similarly, partners at SUEZ worked tirelessly to establish alternative disposal routes for the waste and recyclables in the same timeframe.

The Convener ackowledged that it had been a very trying time for the Waste Team in particular, and she took the opportunity to thank all of those involved, but also to the other services who came to assist such as Fleet Services, Building Services and the, Roads and Environment Teams to name a few. The Convener intimated that this had been a fantastic example of teamwork and concluded that events like this were very difficult, but the resilience shown by the staff in the face of such adversity was heartening.

Secondly, the Convener advised that Seaton Park had recently been named as Scotland's Favourite Park 2022 and wished to express her thanks to everyone involved in this fantastic achievement.

31 August 2022

DETERMINATION OF EXEMPT BUSINESS

- 2. The Committee was requested to determine that the following item of business, which contained exempt information as described in Schedule 7(A) of the Local Government (Scotland) Act 1973, be taken in private:-
 - 11.1 Refurbishment/Improvements to Memorial Garden at Aberdeen Crematorium.

The Committee resolved:

in terms of Section 50A(4) of the Local Government (Scotland) Act 1973, to exclude the press and public from the meeting during consideration of item 11.1 (Refurbishment/Improvements to Memorial Garden at Aberdeen Crematorium) so as to avoid disclosure of exempt information of the classes described in paragraph 6 of Schedule 7A of the Act.

DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST OR CONNECTIONS

3. Councillor Brooks advised that he had a connection in relation to agenda item 10.10 (Supporting People Through the Cost of living Crisis) by virtue of him being a trustee of a Foodbank. However, having applied the objective test he did not consider that he had an interest and would not be withdrawing from the meeting during consideration of the item.

MINUTE OF THE PREVIOUS MEETING OF 9 JUNE 2022

4. The Committee had before it the minute of its previous meeting of 9 June 2022, for approval.

The Committee resolved:-

to approve the minute as a correct record.

COMMITTEE BUSINESS PLANNER

5. The Committee had before it the committee business planner as prepared by the Interim Chief Officer – Governance.

The Committee resolved:-

to note the information contained within the business planner.

31 August 2022

NOTICE OF MOTION BY COUNCILLOR HUTCHISON

6. The Committee had before it a notice of motion by Councillor Hutchison in the following terms:-

That the Committee:-

- notes the role of the Council in protecting tenants in the private rented housing sector through licensing, registration and enforcement;
- agrees that everyone living in the rented private sector should be able to have an expectation of safe, secure and good0quality housing, and that this is undermined where landlords fail to meet their legal obligations; and
- instructs the Chief Officer Early Intervention and Community Empowerment to report to a future committee on the operation of the private landlord registration and HMO licensing schemes, and short term lets legislation preparedness in Aberdeen. This should include the action taken when complaints are received about unlicensed landlords, and options to ensure that the public are aware of how to raise complaints.

The Committee resolved:-

to approve the motion.

NOTICE OF MOTION BY COUNCILLOR MALIK

7. The Committee had before it a notice of motion by Councillor Malik, in the following terms:-

That the Committee:-

- 1. notes the absolutely brilliant work the Culter's Men's Shed do for the community of Peterculter and beyond;
- 2. notes that men, particularly when not in employment, can suffer from social isolation, often leading to deterioration of mental health and physical wellbeing:
- 3. notes experience has shown that being a member of a Men's Shed has a very positive effect on such wellbeing. Notes the former cadet hut in the Bush at Peterculter was identified as an ideal location for the Men's Shed, which was initially leased to Culter Men's Shed by Aberdeen City Council, then purchased outright in November 2019:
- 4. notes that the Culter Men's Shed Committee had been advised on numerous occasions that people are unfamiliar with the location of the Men's Shed;
- 5. agrees that it is in the Council's interest to ensure the wellbeing of citizens is at the forefront of its policies for the city of Aberdeen;

31 August 2022

- 6. agrees that the Council should promote Culter Men's Shed and other Men's Sheds as a force for good and encourage men to make use of such facilities: and
- 7. agrees to instruct the Chief Officer Operations and Protective Services to report to a future meting of the appropriate committee, seeking:-
 - a decision in relation to requested installation of signage on Malcolm Road, directing people to the Culter Men's Shed in order that it can be used by those in most need; and
 - (ii) approval of a Council policy concerning signage of this nature, such policy to include criteria for determining requests for such signage and provision as to the costs associated with such signage.

The Committee resolved:-

- (i) to approve the notice of motion with the exception of 7(a); and
- (ii) to request that in relation to 7 (b) that a report be brought back to the relevant committee in two committee cycles.

REFERRAL FROM THE DISABILITY EQUITY PARTNERSHIP

8. The Committee had before it a referral from the Disability Equity Partnership (DEP), which requested a change to their Constitution as follows:-

"Membership is open to all persons who are normally resident within the city of Aberdeen, or to those who regularly work or study in the city or access city services."

The Committee resolved:-

to approve the revised Constitution for the Disability Equity Partnership.

PERFORMANCE REPORT - CUS/22/160

9. The Committee had before it a report by the Director of Customer Services, which presented Committee with the status of key performance measures relating to the Operations (non-Education) and Customer functions.

The report recommended:-

that the Committee provide comments and observations on the performance information contained in report Appendix A.

The Committee resolved:-

to note the information contained within the Performance Report.

ROAD WINTER SERVICE PLAN 2022-23

31 August 2022

10.

The Committee had before it a report by the Chief Officer – Operations and Protective Services, which presented the Road Winter Service Plan for the coming winter and to highlight any significant changes.

The report recommended:-

that the Committee -

- (a) approves the "Roads Winter Service Plan 2022/2023" (Appendix 1);
- (b) delegates authority to the Chief Officer Operations and Protective Services to, following consultation with the Chief Officer Finance, continue to deliver the Winter Maintenance Service; and
- (c) instructs the Chief Officer Operations and Protective Services to hold an induction meeting on a date to be arranged, for new and existing elected members on the winter service process.

The Committee resolved:-

- (i) to instruct the Chief Officer Operations and Protective Services to engage, prior to the production of future years' Roads Winter Service Plans, with active travel groups including Aberdeen Cycle Forum and Grampian Cycling Partnership to confirm that the main cycling commuting routes agreed in 2013 and listed in appendix C section G are still the main routes used; and
- (ii) to otherwise approve the recommendations.

CHILDREN'S SOCIAL WORK STATISTICS, SCOTLAND 2020-21 - OPE/22/157

11. The Committee had before it a report by the Chief Officer – Integrated Children's and Family Services, which outlined the Children's Social Work Statistics, Scotland 2020-21, and provided a comparison with performance in Aberdeen City.

The report recommended:-

that the Committee -

- (a) notes that care experienced children and those children who need protection in Aberdeen City, are, predominantly, receiving care and protection either in line with, or better than, national averages;
- (b) notes that where performance differs from national averages, there are improvement plans in place; and
- (c) instructs the Chief Officer Integrated Children's and Family Services, to report annually to the relevant Committee, sharing the published Children's Social Work Statistics, Scotland and providing a comparison with performance in Aberdeen City.

The Committee resolved:-

to approve the recommendations.

31 August 2022

ABERDEEN CITY AUTISM STRATEGY UPDATE REPORT - ACHSCP/22/162

12. The Committee had before it a report by the Chief Officer – Integrated Children's and Family Services, which provided an update on the implementation of the Aberdeen City Autism Strategy and Action Plan 2019-22.

The report also detailed the intended work that will inform future strategic direction and documentation.

The report recommended:-

that the Committee -

- (a) notes the report and the information on progress against the action plan as presented in Appendix A; and
- (b) notes the intended work that will inform the future strategic direction and documentation.

The Committee resolved:-

to approve the recommendations.

DIGITAL SUPPORT FOR CARE LEAVERS - OPE/22/164

13. With reference to article 6 of the minute of meeting of 16 September 2021, the Committee had before it a report by the Chief Officer – Integrated Children's and Family Services, which outlined the progress made on the delivery of the agreed plan to address the digital support needs of care leavers.

The report recommended:-

that the Committee notes the progress being achieved and that full implementation of the plan was ongoing and being embedded into business as usual activity.

The Committee resolved:-

to approve the recommendation.

At this juncture, Councillor Nicoll advised that he had a connection in relation to the following item of business, having been involved in the Piper Alpha Inquiry and the recovery, identification and repatriation of the victims, however having applied the objective test he did not consider that he had an interest and would not be withdrawing from the meeting.

31 August 2022

PIPER ALPHA MEMORIAL - OPE/22/175

14. The Committee had before it a report by the Chief Officer – Operations and Protective Services, which provided an update on the current situation regarding the Piper Alpha Memorial and the North Sea Memorial Rose Gardens at Hazlehead Park.

The report recommended:-

that the Committee -

- (a) notes the contents of the report;
- (b) notes the cost of replanting the empty rose beds and that there was currently no budget allocated to this work; and
- (c) instructs the Chief Officer Operations and Protective Services to report back to the relevant committee in the next committee cycle with a further update.

Councillor Nicoll, seconded by the Depute Provost, Councillor Delaney, moved:-That the Committee:-

- (a) note the contents of the report;
- (b) instruct the Chief Officer Operations and Protective Services to liaise with interested parties as to their preferred options for the future of the Piper Alpha Memorial and to include in those options presented to those parties, the option of the replanting of roses including any cost implications;
- (c) instruct the Chief Officer Operations and Protective Services to report the outcome of the meeting(s) with interested parties to the next appropriate Committee meeting and seek a decision; and
- (d) instruct the Chief Officer Operations and Protective Services to provide an update to a Council meeting when appropriate.

Councillor Macdonald moved as an amendment, seconded by Councillor Thomson: That the Committee:-

- (i) note the contents of the report;
- refer the matter to City Growth and Resources Committee in September 2022, with a recommendation to allocate funding to replant the empty rosebeds, and approve the use of the 2022/23 General Fund Contingencies Budget to fund the cost of replating the empty rose beds; and
- (iii) instruct the Chief Officer Operations and Protective Services, to report back to the December Full Council with a further update.

On a division there voted:- <u>for the motion</u> (7) – the Convener, the Vice Convener, Councillor Cameron, the Lord Provost, Councillor Delaney, the Depute Provost; and Councillors Hutchison, McRae and Nicoll; <u>for the amendment</u> (6) – Councillors Ali, Brooks, Macdonald, Massey, McLeod and Thomson.

31 August 2022

The Committee resolved:-

to adopt the motion.

In terms of Standing Order 32.8, Councillor Macdonald expressed her dissent against the foregoing decision.

NOTICE OF MOTION BY COUNCILLOR STEWART FOR A PROPOSED CONTROLLED PEDESTRIAN CROSSING ON SPRINGFIELD ROAD IN THE VICINITY OF CRAIGIEBUCKLER AVENUE - OPE/22/077

15. The Committee had before it a report by the Chief Officer – Operations and Protective Services, which provided information on the outcome of pedestrian surveys, undertaken in accordance with methods adopted by Aberdeen City Council, to determine whether a controlled pedestrian crossing facility was justified on Springfield Road near to its junction with Craigiebuckler Avenue.

Councillor Stewart spoke in support of her motion and explained the rationale behind her request.

The report recommended:-

that the Committee -

- (a) notes the content of the report; and
- (b) agrees that no further action is be taken in relation to the provision of a controlled pedestrian crossing facility on Springfield Road near to its junction with Craigiebuckler Avenue.

The Committee resolved:-

to approve the recommendations.

NOTICE OF MOTION BY COUNCILLOR STEWART TO CONSIDER OPTIONS FOR PEDESTRIAN CROSSINGS ON KING'S GATE AND FOREST ROAD - OPE/22/076

16. The Committee had before it a report by the Chief Officer – Operations and Protective Services, which responded to the Notice of Motion by Councillor Stewart to consider options for installing an additional pedestrian crossing on King's Gate in the vicinity of the Atholl Hotel and installing a crossing on Forest Road near its junction with King's Gate.

Councillor Stewart spoke in furtherance of her motion and explained the rationale behind her request.

The report recommended:-

that the Committee -

31 August 2022

- (a) notes the review as recorded within the report;
- (b) agrees the current pedestrian crossing infrastructure on King's Gate near Forest Road meets the needs of local people, including children and their families walking to local schools; and
- (c) notes that the results of observational surveys and a cursory pedestrian routes to school plotting exercise showed a moderate demand to cross King's Gate near Moray Place, and instruct the Chief Officer, Operations and Protective Services to install a new pedestrian island with minor adjustments to the existing infrastructure.

The Committee resolved:-

to approve the recommendations.

ANNUAL ASSURANCE STATEMENT - CUS/22/142

17. The Committee had before it a report by the Chief Officer – Early Intervention and Community Empowerment, which sought approval for the Council's Annual Assurance Statement for the year 2022/23, which must be submitted to the Scottish Housing Regulator by 31 October 2022.

The report recommended:-

that the Committee approve the Annual Assurance Statement appended to the report for submission to the Scottish Housing Regulator by 31 October 2022.

The Committee resolved:-

to approve the recommendation.

ABERDEEN CITY EMPTY HOMES UPDATE REPORT - CUS/22/153

18. The Committee had before it a report by the Chief Officer – Early Intervention and Community Empowerment, which provided an update on the progress made in relation to empty homes.

The report recommended:-

that the Committee note the progress made in relation to empty homes.

The Committee resolved:-

to approve the recommendation.

At this juncture, the Vice Convener and Councillor Delaney, the Depute Provost advised that they had a connection in relation

31 August 2022

to the following item of business, due to knowing the Chief Executive of Instant Neighbour, however having applied the objective test they did not consider that they had an interest and would not be withdrawing from the meeting.

SUPPORTING PEOPLE THROUGH THE COST OF LIVING CRISIS - CUS/22/151

19. The Committee had before it a report by the Chief Officer – Early Intervention and Community Empowerment, which responded to the decision taken by Council at the meeting on 13 July 2022, to approve that the £1,000,000 Fuel Poverty Fund be considered in the wider Cost of Living Support report.

The report recommended:-

that the Committee -

- (a) allocates £430,000 to Community Food Initiatives North East for investment in food procurement, development of food pantries (300 memberships, weekly food shops, management and admin); and Support, Advice, Finance and Education team support;
- (b) allocates £300,000 to the Scottish Welfare Fund provision to reinstate medium priority applications to the end of March 2023;
- (c) allocates £100,000 to SCARF to assist in alleviating fuel poverty through distribution of fuel vouchers and trialling a 'cash first' approach;
- (d) allocates £100,000 to ABZ works to support 100 lone parent families through existing employability programmes:
- (e) allocates £45,000 to the provision of insulation measures for 500 homes;
- (f) allocates £25,000 to establish a Family Wellbeing Fund, to support families through the provision of advice and to develop a support plan;
- (g) instructs the Chief Officer Early Intervention and Community Empowerment to make arrangements to distribute the funds as required; and
- (h) instructs the Chief Officer Early Intervention and Community Empowerment to report to a future Committee on the outcomes achieved by the allocation of funds.

The Convener moved, seconded by the Vice Convener:That the Committee:-

- (1) approve the recommendations contained in the report;
- (2) instruct the Chief Officer Early Intervention and Community Empowerment to report to the relevant committee on the provision of warm spaces within Aberdeen and explore any support that can be provided to communities visiting them; and
- (3) should additional resources be made available by either the UK or Scottish Government for fuel and the cost of living crisis, to instruct the relevant Chief Officer to report to the relevant committee with options for the best allocation of these funds;

Councillor Grant moved as an amendment, seconded by Councillor Thomson:-

31 August 2022

That the Committee:-

- a) Agrees that inadequate cost-of-living support presents an immediate and serious risk to people, communities and businesses in Aberdeen;
- b) Notes that the available £1million fund was only made possible as a result of decisions taken by the previous Labour-led Council administration within the approved budget in March 2022;
- c) Notes the "Working in Partnership for Aberdeen" policy statement, approved on 18 May 2022 aims to, "devolve at least 1% of the council's annual budget to communities, allowing them to decide their spending priorities through participative budgeting.";
- d) Instructs the Chief Officer Early Intervention and Community Empowerment to bring an urgent report to the City Growth and Resources Committee on 21st September seeking approval of a proposal to create a special Participatory Budget focusing on the cost-of-living to enable residents and communities to work together to develop solutions and fund community-led cost-of-living initiatives and approval to commit up to £100,000 from the 2022/23 General Fund contingencies budget for this purpose, with the Chief Officer reporting back to the appropriate committee on the outcomes achieved and seeking the views of the Fairer Aberdeen Board in preparing this report;
- e) Notes that as the Cost-of-Living crisis worsens, hard pressed families will struggle even more to make one off annual purchases such as winter clothing items for children. Notes that in November 2021, local charity AberNecessities, reported a 200 percent rise in demands for help for, among other things, winter clothing such as winter jackets, hats, gloves, scarves and footwear. Notes that Aberdeen City Council already provides school clothing grant;
- f) Instructs the Chief Officer Early Intervention and Community Empowerment to bring an urgent report to the City Growth and Resources Committee on 21st September seeking approval of a proposal to create a winter clothing grants scheme to help struggling families be able to apply for some funds to help with these one- off winter costs and approval to commit up to £50,000 from the 2022/23 General Fund contingencies budget;
- g) Notes that recent surveys commissioned by the Liberal Democrats show that 27% of families with children at home plan not to turn their heating on this winter, with 33% of parents surveyed saying they will use credit cards and increased debt to pay their bills. Notes research commissioned by the University of York which reported that pensioners and larger families will be worst affected by rising energy costs with 90% expected to be in fuel poverty by January 2023;
- h) Notes that many community facilities are anticipating an increase in demand for help and support over the coming winter. Agrees in principle that the Council should support these community facilities, such as community centres, libraries and community flats to help them cope with increased demands;
- i) Instructs the Chief Officer Early Intervention and Community Empowerment to bring a report to the soonest appropriate committee with proposals on making extra provision available to support community facilities to cope with rising demands regarding energy costs, additional demand for their food bank provision

31 August 2022

and an increase in demand for support and advocacy for struggling people. Agrees that any financial costs of such extra provision should be referred to the appropriate Committee with a recommendation that such costs be funded from the 2022/23 General Fund Contingencies Budget;

- j) Notes that section 3.5 references the commitment to provide free school meals for all Primary school pupils in Scotland and that this policy will play an increasingly important role in ensuring Primary school pupils receive at least one healthy and nutritious meal per day, as the cost-of-living crisis worsens and child poverty rates rise. Notes that at present, free school meal entitlement only extends from pre-school to primary 5 and that the Scottish Government has intimated this will not be extended to P6 and P7 until "later in the parliamentary term", that is after the cost-of-living crisis of winter 2022/23;
- k) Instructs the Chief Executive to write to the Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills requesting an urgent update on the status of the policy and for this policy to be implemented as a matter of urgency in light of the Cost-of-Living crisis;
- Instructs the Chief Officer Early Intervention and Community Empowerment, following consultation with the Chief Officer Finance, to bring a subsequent report on the Cost-of-Living Crisis to the November 2022 Finance and Resources Committee reporting on any additional cost-of-living support that is announced by the Scottish and UK Governments. This report will consider officer assessment of remaining risk to vulnerable and hard-pressed families, communities and businesses and make recommendations on where and if the Council can provide added value and support to those most at risk of continued vulnerability;
- m) Agrees that the previous Labour-led administration helped over 22,000 council tenants by freezing their rents for the last two years; and
- n) Agrees that the cost-of-living crisis will impact adversely on the majority of Aberdeen citizens and calls upon the UK and Scottish governments to urgently bring forward more support packages to help citizens cope.

On a division, there voted - <u>for the motion</u> (7) - the Convener, the Vice Convener, Councillor Cameron, <u>the Lord Provost</u>, Councillor Delaney, <u>the Depute Provost</u> and Councillors Hutchison, McRae and Nicoll - <u>for the amendment</u> - Councillors Ali, Brooks, Grant, Massey, McLeod and Thomson.

The Committee resolved:-

- (i) to adopt the motion;
- (ii) to request that in relation to the money allocated to Community Food Initiatives North East, to send information to members by way of email, the breakdown of the costs of administration and management; and
- (iii) to request that the Chief Officer Early Intervention and Community Empowerment, investigate if there had been any requests from tenants to switch off their gas supply, following press coverage regarding Langstane Housing and tenants asking for their gas supply to be turned off due to the soaring fuel costs, and to advise members accordingly of any such requests.

31 August 2022

CHILD POVERTY ACTION PLAN ANNUAL STATUTORY REPORT 2021/22 - CUS/22/149

20. The Committee had before it a report by the Chief Officer – Early Intervention and Community Empowerment, which presented the Child Poverty Action report for 2021/22, as required by the Child Poverty (Scotland) Act 2017.

The report recommended:-

that the Committee -

- (a) approves the joint Aberdeen City Council and NHS Grampian Child Poverty Action Report 2021/22 for submission to the Scottish Government;
- (b) notes that this report has been created without access to national child poverty data; and
- (c) instructs the Chief Officer Early Intervention and Community Empowerment to review the Council's approach to tackling Child Poverty, in conjunction with Community Planning Partners through the Community Planning Aberdeen Anti Poverty group, and bring a report back to the relevant Committee detailing a refreshed action plan for 2022-2026.

CHILD POVERTY ACTION PLAN 2022/23 - 6 MONTHLY UPDATE - CUS/22/150

21. With reference to article 13 of the minute of meeting of 13 January 2021, the Committee had before it a report by the Chief Officer – Early Intervention and Community Empowerment, which provided details on the actions being taken by Community Planning Aberdeen (CPA) to reduce and eradicate child poverty around the priorities for that year.

The report recommended:-

that the Committee note the work being undertaken this financial year to reduce and eradicate child poverty.

The Committee resolved:-

to approve the recommendation.

FREE PERIOD PRODUCTS - CUS/22/182

22. The Committee had before it a report by the Chief Officer – Early Intervention and Community Empowerment, which made reference to Section 6 of the Period Products (Free Provision) (Scotland) Act 2021 (the Act) which required Aberdeen City Council to

31 August 2022

produce and communicate a "Statement on Exercise of Functions" and outlined the arrangements in place to meet the legal duties imposed by the Act.

The report recommended:-

that the Committee approves the "Statement on Exercise of Functions" contained in Appendix 1 and instructs the Chief Officer – Early Intervention and Community Empowerment to arrange for the publication thereof.

The Committee resolved:-

- (i) in relation to education facilities, to also include staff members as well as students; and
- (ii) to otherwise approve the recommendation.

In accordance with Article 1 of this minute, the following item was considered with the press and public excluded.

REFURBISHMENT/IMPROVEMENTS TO MEMORIAL GARDEN AT ABERDEEN CREMATORIUM - OPE/22/176

23. The Committee had before it a report by the Chief Officer – Operations and Protective Services, which sought approval for improvements to be made to the Memorial Garden at Aberdeen Crematorium located off Skene Road, Hazlehead.

The report recommended:-

that the Committee -

- (a) approves the improvement plan detailed in this report for the Memorial Garden at Aberdeen Crematorium, and
- (b) instructs the Chief Officer Operations and Protective Services to arrange for the display and promotion of the improvement plan, and to consult on the plan with the public who visit and use the gardens.

The Committee resolved:-

to approve the recommendations

VALEDICTORY

24. The Convener advised that this was the final Committee meeting before being disbanded and also intimated that Rob Polkinghorne, Chief Operating Officer and Executive Lead for this Committee would soon be leaving the Council. The Convener expressed her thanks to Mr Polkinghorne for all of his efforts over the years.

31 August 2022

Councillor Grant also echoed the Convener's comments on behalf of Aberdeen Labour Group.

- COUNCILLOR MIRANDA RADLEY - Convener